## Math 655: Statistical Theories of TurbulenceFall, 2015Assignment 3October 23, 2015due November 20, 2015

1. (a) Let f and g be functions from  $\mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$  with Fourier transforms  $f_k$  and  $g_k$ , respectively. Prove in n dimensions that

$$\frac{1}{(2\pi)^n} \int \langle f_{\boldsymbol{k}} g_{\boldsymbol{k}}^* \rangle \, e^{i \boldsymbol{k} \cdot \boldsymbol{\ell}} \, d\boldsymbol{k} = \int \langle f(\boldsymbol{r} + \boldsymbol{\ell}) g(\boldsymbol{r}) \rangle \, d\boldsymbol{r}.$$

$$\frac{1}{(2\pi)^n} \int \langle f_{\boldsymbol{k}} g_{\boldsymbol{k}}^* \rangle \, e^{i\boldsymbol{k}\cdot\boldsymbol{\ell}} \, d\boldsymbol{k} = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^n} \int \int \int \langle f(\boldsymbol{r}')g(\boldsymbol{r}) \rangle \, e^{-i\boldsymbol{k}\cdot\boldsymbol{r}' + i\boldsymbol{k}\cdot\boldsymbol{r} + i\boldsymbol{k}\cdot\boldsymbol{\ell}} \, d\boldsymbol{r}' \, d\boldsymbol{r} \, d\boldsymbol{k} = \int \langle f(\boldsymbol{r}+\boldsymbol{\ell})g(\boldsymbol{r}) \rangle \, d\boldsymbol{r}.$$

(b) Consider the case where f and g are periodic on an *n*-dimensional cube V of side  $2\pi$  and introduce the Fourier coefficients

$$f_{\boldsymbol{k}} = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^n} \int_V f(\boldsymbol{x}) e^{-i\boldsymbol{k}\cdot\boldsymbol{x}} \, d\boldsymbol{x}.$$

Use the discrete formulation of part(a) to derive the *n*-dimensional version of the *Wiener-Khinchin* formula [Frisch, p. 54].

Hints: The inverse Fourier theorem tells us that

$$f(\boldsymbol{x}) = \sum_{\boldsymbol{k}} f_{\boldsymbol{k}} e^{i\boldsymbol{k}\cdot\boldsymbol{x}};$$

this result can be expressed either as

$$\sum_{\boldsymbol{k}} e^{i\boldsymbol{k}\cdot(\boldsymbol{x}-\boldsymbol{x}')} = (2\pi)^n \delta(\boldsymbol{x}-\boldsymbol{x}').$$

or

$$\int_{V} e^{i(\boldsymbol{k}-\boldsymbol{k}')\cdot\boldsymbol{x}} d\boldsymbol{x} = (2\pi)^{n} \delta_{\boldsymbol{k},\boldsymbol{k}'}.$$

The discrete Fourier version of part(a) reads

$$\sum_{\boldsymbol{k}} \langle f_{\boldsymbol{k}} g_{\boldsymbol{k}}^* \rangle e^{i \boldsymbol{k} \cdot \boldsymbol{\ell}} = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^n} \int_V \langle f(\boldsymbol{r} + \boldsymbol{\ell}) g(\boldsymbol{r}) \rangle \ d\boldsymbol{r}.$$

On setting f = g and taking the discrete Fourier transform, we find

$$\frac{1}{(2\pi)^n} \sum_{\boldsymbol{k}} \int_{V} \langle |f_{\boldsymbol{k}}|^2 \rangle \, e^{i\boldsymbol{k}\cdot\boldsymbol{\ell} + i\boldsymbol{p}\cdot\boldsymbol{\ell}} \, d\boldsymbol{\ell} = \langle |f_{\boldsymbol{p}}|^2 \rangle = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^{2n}} \int_{V} \int_{V} \langle f(\boldsymbol{r}+\boldsymbol{\ell})f(\boldsymbol{r}) \rangle \, e^{i\boldsymbol{p}\cdot\boldsymbol{\ell}} \, d\boldsymbol{r} \, d\boldsymbol{\ell}$$

Under the assumption of homogeneity, we have  $\langle f(\mathbf{r} + \boldsymbol{\ell}) f(\mathbf{r}) \rangle = \Gamma(\boldsymbol{\ell})$ . Since  $\int_V d\mathbf{r} = (2\pi)^n$ , we deduce

$$\langle |f_{\boldsymbol{p}}|^2 \rangle = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^n} \int \Gamma(\boldsymbol{\ell}) e^{i \boldsymbol{p} \cdot \boldsymbol{\ell}} d\boldsymbol{\ell}.$$

2. Show that even though Burgers equation,

$$\frac{\partial u}{\partial t} + u \frac{\partial u}{\partial x} = \nu \frac{\partial^2 u}{\partial x^2},$$

is nonlinear, it can be reduced to the solution of a (linear) heat equation by the transformation

$$u(x,t) = -2\nu \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \log h(x,t).$$

First, rewrite Burgers equation as

$$u_t + \frac{1}{2}(u^2)_x = \nu u_{xx}$$

We are asked to try to express the solution in terms of a potential  $\phi = -2\nu \log h$ (which we assume to be  $C^2$ ), such that  $u = \phi_x$ :

$$\phi_{xt} + \frac{1}{2}(\phi_x^2)_x = \nu \phi_{xxx}.$$

On integrating with respect to x, we find

$$\phi_t + \frac{1}{2}(\phi_x^2) = \nu \phi_{xx} + C(t),$$

where C(t) is an unknown function of t. Now  $\phi_t = -2\nu h_t/h$ ,  $\phi_x = -2\nu h_x/h$  and

$$\phi_{xx} = \frac{2\nu}{h^2}h_x^2 - \frac{2\nu}{h}h_{xx}.$$

Thus

$$C(t) = \phi_t + \frac{1}{2}(\phi_x^2) - \nu\phi_{xx} = -\frac{2\nu h_t}{h} + \frac{2\nu^2 h_x^2}{h^2} - \frac{2\nu^2}{h^2}h_x^2 + \frac{2\nu^2}{h}h_{xx} = -\frac{2\nu h_t}{h} + \frac{2\nu^2}{h}h_{xx},$$

which simplifies to the linear equation

$$h_t + \frac{C(t)}{2\nu}h = \nu h_{xx}$$

If we let  $H(x,t) = h(x,t)e^{\int C(t) dt/(2\nu)}$ , we obtain a heat equation for H(x,t),

$$H_t = \nu H_{xx},$$

which can then be solved to find u(x, t):

$$u(x,t) = -2\nu \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \log h(x,t) = -2\nu \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \log H(x,t).$$

Note that u does not actually depend on the function C(t).

This remarkable result is known as the Cole-Hopf transformation (Forsyth 1906, Cole 1950, Hopf 1952).

3. Let  $v_x$  represent any particular component of the velocity for homogeneous isotropic three-dimensional turbulence. Show that

$$\langle v_x^2 \rangle = \frac{2E}{3}, \qquad \left\langle \left(\frac{\partial v_x}{\partial x}\right)^2 \right\rangle = \frac{2}{15}Z,$$
  
 $\lambda^2 = \frac{5E}{Z}, \qquad R_\lambda = \sqrt{\frac{10}{3}}\frac{E}{Z^{1/2}\nu},$ 

where E is the turbulent energy, Z is the turbulent enstrophy,

$$\lambda = \left(\frac{\langle v_x^2 \rangle}{\left\langle \left(\frac{\partial v_x}{\partial x}\right)^2 \right\rangle}\right)^{1/2}$$

is the Taylor microscale, and  $R_{\lambda} = \lambda \sqrt{\langle v_x^2 \rangle} / \nu$  is the Taylor Reynolds number. Hints: Use the properties of the partial derivatives of the homogeneous isotropic correlation tensor  $\Gamma_{kk'}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = \langle v_k(\boldsymbol{x})v_{k'}(\boldsymbol{x} + \boldsymbol{\ell}) \rangle$ . For example:

$$\left\langle \frac{\partial v_k(\boldsymbol{x})}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial v_{k'}(\boldsymbol{x}+\boldsymbol{\ell})}{\partial x_{j'}} \right\rangle = \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{j'}} \left\langle \frac{\partial v_k(\boldsymbol{x})}{\partial x_j} v_{k'}(\boldsymbol{x}+\boldsymbol{\ell}) \right\rangle = \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{j'}} \left\langle \frac{\partial v_k(\boldsymbol{x}-\boldsymbol{\ell})}{\partial x_j} v_{k'}(\boldsymbol{x}) \right\rangle$$
$$= -\frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_j} \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{j'}} \left\langle v_k(\boldsymbol{x}-\boldsymbol{\ell}) v_{k'}(\boldsymbol{x}) \right\rangle = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_j} \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{j'}} \Gamma_{kk'}.$$

Also, parity requires that  $\Gamma_{kj}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = \langle v_k(0)v_j(-\boldsymbol{\ell})\rangle = \langle v_j(0)v_k(\boldsymbol{\ell})\rangle = \Gamma_{jk}(\boldsymbol{\ell})$  and incompressibility implies that

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_k} \Gamma_{jk}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_k} \Gamma_{kj}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = 0.$$

For isotropic turbulence  $\langle v_x^2 \rangle = \langle v_y^2 \rangle = \langle v_z^2 \rangle$ . We then see immediately that  $2E = 3 \langle v_x^2 \rangle$  and hence  $\langle v_x^2 \rangle = 2E/3$ .

On denoting  $x' = x + \ell$ , v' = v(x'), and  $\omega' = \omega(x')$ , we find

$$2Z = \left\langle \omega_{i}\omega_{i}^{\prime}\right\rangle = \epsilon_{ijk}\epsilon_{ij^{\prime}k^{\prime}}\left\langle \frac{\partial v_{k}}{\partial x_{j}}\frac{\partial v_{k^{\prime}}^{\prime}}{\partial x_{j^{\prime}}^{\prime}}\right\rangle = \left\langle \frac{\partial v_{k}}{\partial x_{j}}\frac{\partial v_{k}^{\prime}}{\partial x_{j}}\right\rangle - \left\langle \frac{\partial v_{k}}{\partial x_{j}}\frac{\partial v_{j}^{\prime}}{\partial x_{k}}\right\rangle$$
$$= -\frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{j}}\frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{j}}\Gamma_{kk}(\ell) + \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{j}}\frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{k}}\Gamma_{kj}(\ell) = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{j}}\frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{j}}\Gamma_{kk}(\ell).$$

The most general isotropic form for  $\Gamma_{ij}$  is

$$\Gamma_{ij}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = A(\ell)\delta_{ij} + B(\ell)\ell_i\ell_j,$$

but incompressibility implies that

$$0 = \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_i} \Gamma_{ij}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = A'(\ell) \frac{\ell_i}{\ell} \delta_{ij} + B'(\ell)\ell\ell_j + B(\ell)(\delta_{ii}\ell_j + \ell_i\delta_{ij}) = \ell_j \left(\frac{A'}{\ell} + B'\ell + 4B\right).$$

On multiplying by  $\ell_j$  and summing over j, we find that  $0 = A' + B'\ell^2 + 4B\ell$ . By differentiating this result with respect to  $\ell$  and taking the limit as  $\ell \to 0$ , we deduce

$$0 = A''(0) + 4B(0).$$

We need to find the Laplacian of  $\Gamma_{ii}(\ell) = A(\ell)\delta_{ii} + B(\ell)\ell_i\ell_i = 3A(\ell) + B(\ell)\ell^2$ . That is, we want to compute

$$-2Z = \lim_{\ell \to 0} \frac{1}{\ell^2} \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell} \ell^2 \frac{\partial \Gamma_{ii}}{\partial \ell} = \lim_{\ell \to 0} \frac{1}{\ell^2} \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell} \left( 3A'\ell^2 + B'\ell^4 + 2B\ell^3 \right)$$
$$= \lim_{\ell \to 0} \frac{1}{\ell^2} \left( 3A''\ell^2 + 6A'\ell + B''\ell^4 + 4B'\ell^3 + 2B'\ell^3 + 6B\ell^2 \right) = 9A''(0) + 6B(0) = \frac{15}{2}A''(0),$$

on noting that A'(0) = 0, since  $A(\ell)$  is an even function, and  $\lim_{\ell \to 0} A'(\ell)/\ell = A''(0)$ .

Finally, we note that since

$$-\left\langle \left(\frac{\partial v_x}{\partial x}\right)^2 \right\rangle = \lim_{\ell \to 0} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial \ell^2} \Gamma_{00}(\ell \hat{\boldsymbol{x}}) = \lim_{\ell \to 0} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial \ell^2} \left(A + B\ell^2\right) = A''(0) + 2B(0) = \frac{A''(0)}{2},$$

it follows that  $2Z = 15 \left\langle \left(\frac{\partial v_x}{\partial x}\right)^2 \right\rangle$ .

The square of the Taylor microscale is then given by

$$\lambda^2 = \frac{\left\langle v_x^2 \right\rangle}{\frac{2Z}{15}} = \frac{5E}{Z},$$

so that the Taylor Reynolds number is given by

$$\frac{1}{\nu}\sqrt{\frac{5E}{Z}}\sqrt{\frac{2E}{3}} = \sqrt{\frac{10}{3Z}}\frac{E}{\nu}.$$

4. A three-dimensional fluid subject to periodic boundary conditions is stirred by an isotropic Gaussian *white-noise* solenoidal force f:

$$\frac{\partial \boldsymbol{u}}{\partial t} + (\boldsymbol{u} \cdot \boldsymbol{\nabla}) \boldsymbol{u} = -\frac{1}{\rho} \boldsymbol{\nabla} P + \nu \nabla^2 \boldsymbol{u} + \boldsymbol{f},$$

such that the Fourier transform  $f_k$  of f satisfies  $k \cdot f_k(t) = 0$  and

$$\langle \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}}(t) \cdot \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}'}^*(t') \rangle = F_{\boldsymbol{k}}^2 \delta_{\boldsymbol{k}\boldsymbol{k}'} \delta(t-t'),$$

Compute the mean rate of energy injection per unit volume  $\epsilon$  in terms of  $F_k$ .

Hint: A solenoidal white-noise Gaussian forcing  $f_k$  has the form  $f_k(t) = N_k (1 - \frac{kk}{k^2}) \cdot \boldsymbol{\xi}_k(t)$ , where  $N_k$  is real and  $\boldsymbol{\xi}_k$  is a unit central complex Gaussian random 3-vector:  $\langle \boldsymbol{\xi}_k(t) \boldsymbol{\xi}_{k'}^*(t') \rangle = \delta_{kk'} \mathbf{1} \, \delta(t - t')$ . This means that

$$\langle \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}}(t) \cdot \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}'}^{*}(t') \rangle = N_{\boldsymbol{k}} N_{\boldsymbol{k}'} \left( \delta_{ij} - \frac{k_{i}k_{j}}{k^{2}} \right) \left\langle \xi_{\boldsymbol{k}j}(t)\xi_{\boldsymbol{k}'j'}^{*}(t') \right\rangle \left( \delta_{j'i} - \frac{k'_{j'}k'_{i}}{k'^{2}} \right)$$
$$= N_{\boldsymbol{k}}^{2} \delta_{\boldsymbol{k},\boldsymbol{k}'} \delta(t-t') \left( 1 - \frac{\boldsymbol{k}\boldsymbol{k}}{k^{2}} \right) : \left( 1 - \frac{\boldsymbol{k}\boldsymbol{k}}{k^{2}} \right) = 2N_{\boldsymbol{k}}^{2} \delta_{\boldsymbol{k},\boldsymbol{k}'} \delta(t-t').$$

We then see that  $2N_k^2 = F_k^2$  (the factor of 2 signifies that there are only two independent directions, once the incompressibility constraint has been taken into account).

Since the nonlinear (advective and pressure) terms conserve energy, the energy balance reads

$$\left\langle \frac{1}{2V} \int \frac{\partial \left| \boldsymbol{u} \right|^2}{\partial t} \, d\boldsymbol{x} \right\rangle = \left\langle \frac{1}{V} \int \frac{\partial \boldsymbol{u}}{\partial t} \cdot \boldsymbol{u} \, d\boldsymbol{x} \right\rangle = \epsilon - \left\langle \frac{1}{V} \int \nu \left| \boldsymbol{u} \right|^2 \, d\boldsymbol{x} \right\rangle,$$

where V denotes the volume of the periodic box and

$$\epsilon = \frac{1}{V} \int \langle \boldsymbol{f}(\boldsymbol{x}, t) \cdot \boldsymbol{u}(\boldsymbol{x}, t) \rangle \, d\boldsymbol{x} = \operatorname{Re} \sum_{\boldsymbol{k}} \langle \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}}(t) \cdot \boldsymbol{u}_{\boldsymbol{k}}^{*}(t) \rangle$$
$$= \operatorname{Re} \sum_{\boldsymbol{k}, \boldsymbol{k}'} \int \langle \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}}(t) \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}'}^{*}(t') \rangle : \left\langle \frac{\delta \boldsymbol{u}_{\boldsymbol{k}}^{*}(t)}{\delta \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}'}^{*}(t')} \right\rangle \, dt'.$$

Following Novikov [1964], we express

$$\boldsymbol{u}_{\boldsymbol{k}}(t) = \boldsymbol{u}_{\boldsymbol{k}}(t') + \int_{t'}^{t} A_{\boldsymbol{k}}[\boldsymbol{u}(\bar{t})] \, d\bar{t} + \int_{t'}^{t} \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}}(\bar{t}) \, d\bar{t}$$

in terms of some unknown functional  $A_k$  of the velocity field u(t) at time t. If  $A_k$  has a bounded functional derivative, we can compute the nonlinear Green's function

$$\frac{\delta \boldsymbol{u}_{\boldsymbol{k}}(t)}{\delta \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}'}(t')} = \int_{t'}^{t} \frac{\delta A_{\boldsymbol{k}}[\boldsymbol{u}(\bar{t})]}{\delta \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}'}(t')} \, d\bar{t} + \int_{t'}^{t} \delta_{\boldsymbol{k}\boldsymbol{k}'} \mathbf{1}\delta(\bar{t}-t') \, d\bar{t} = \int_{t'}^{t} \frac{\delta A_{\boldsymbol{k}}[\boldsymbol{u}(\bar{t})]}{\delta \boldsymbol{f}_{\boldsymbol{k}'}(t')} \, d\bar{t} + \delta_{\boldsymbol{k}\boldsymbol{k}'} \mathbf{1}H(t-t').$$

Since  $H(0) = \frac{1}{2}$ , we obtain

$$\epsilon = \sum_{k} N_{k}^{2} \left( 1 - \frac{kk}{k^{2}} \right) : \left( 1 - \frac{kk}{k^{2}} \right) H(0) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k} 2N_{k}^{2} = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k} F_{k}^{2}.$$

5. Consider the two-point velocity increment correlation tensor

$$B_{ij}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = \langle (v_i(\boldsymbol{r}) - v_i(\boldsymbol{r} + \boldsymbol{\ell}))(v_j(\boldsymbol{r}) - v_j(\boldsymbol{r} + \boldsymbol{\ell})) \rangle$$

of an incompressible three-dimensional homogeneous and isotropic turbulent velocity field.

(a) Using the fact that the most general isotropic second-rank tensor can be written in the form

$$B_{ij}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = A(\ell)\delta_{ij} + B(\ell)n_in_j,$$

where  $\boldsymbol{n} = \boldsymbol{\ell}/\ell$  is the unit vector in the direction of  $\boldsymbol{\ell}$ , show that

$$B_{ij} = B_{TT}(\delta_{ij} - n_i n_j) + B_{LL} n_i n_j,$$

where  $B_{LL}$  is the longitudinal mean-square velocity increment (corresponding to the direction of  $\ell$ ) and  $B_{TT}$  is the transverse mean-square velocity increment (corresponding to the directions transverse to  $\ell$ ).

Since  $n_L = 1$  and  $n_T = 0$  we see that  $B_{LL} = A + B$  and  $B_{TT} = A$ . Hence

$$B_{ij} = B_{TT}\delta_{ij} + (B_{LL} - B_{TT})n_i n_j,$$

(b) Show that

$$B_{ij}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = \frac{2}{3} \left\langle v^2 \right\rangle \delta_{ij} - 2 \left\langle v_i(\boldsymbol{r}) v_j(\boldsymbol{r} + \boldsymbol{\ell}) \right\rangle$$

and hence

$$\frac{\partial B_{ij}}{\partial \ell_j} = 0.$$

Using homogeneity and the parity symmetry  $x \to -x$ ,  $v \to -v$ , we simplify

$$B_{ij}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = \langle v_i(\boldsymbol{r})v_j(\boldsymbol{r})\rangle - \langle v_i(\boldsymbol{r}+\boldsymbol{\ell})v_j(\boldsymbol{r})\rangle - \langle v_i(\boldsymbol{r})v_j(\boldsymbol{r}+\boldsymbol{\ell})\rangle + \langle v_i(\boldsymbol{r}+\boldsymbol{\ell})v_j(\boldsymbol{r}+\boldsymbol{\ell})\rangle = 2 \langle v_i(\boldsymbol{0})v_j(\boldsymbol{0})\rangle - 2 \langle v_i(\boldsymbol{r})v_j(\boldsymbol{r}+\boldsymbol{\ell})\rangle$$

Furthermore, the parity symmetry  $x \to -x$ ,  $v_x \to -v_x$  implies that  $\langle v_x(\mathbf{0})v_y(\mathbf{0})\rangle = -\langle v_x(\mathbf{0})v_y(\mathbf{0})\rangle$ , etc., so that  $\langle v_i(\mathbf{0})v_j(\mathbf{0})\rangle = 2E\delta_{ij}/3$  (no summation), using our first result from Question 3. Since  $E = \frac{1}{2} \langle v^2 \rangle$ , we conclude that

$$B_{ij}(\boldsymbol{\ell}) = \frac{2}{3} \left\langle v^2 \right\rangle \delta_{ij} - 2 \left\langle v_i(0) v_j(\boldsymbol{\ell}) \right\rangle$$

It is now clear that the incompressibility condition  $\partial v_j(\ell)/\partial \ell_j = 0$  implies that  $\partial B_{ij}/\partial \ell_j = 0$ .

(c) Show that

$$\frac{1}{\ell}\frac{\partial}{\partial\ell}(\ell^2 B_{LL}) = 2B_{TT}$$

Show that your result agrees with Eq. (12) in Kolmogorov's first 1941 paper, The local structure of turbulence in incompressible viscous fluid for very large Reynolds numbers. Note: The notation that Kolmogorov uses for the transverse and longitudinal components is defined in his third paper, Dissipation of energy in the locally isotropic turbulence. Kolmogorov used this result to calculate an expression for the mean energy dissipation rate in terms of the viscosity and the second derivative of  $B_{LL}$ .

On multiplying our result in part (a) by  $n_i$  and summing over i, we find

$$n_i B_{ij} = B_{TT}(n_j - n_j) + B_{LL}n_j = B_{LL}n_j$$

On differentiating both sides with respect to  $\ell_j$  we find

$$\frac{\partial n_i}{\partial \ell_j} B_{ij} + n_i \frac{\partial B_{ij}}{\partial \ell_j} = \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_j} (B_{LL} n_j).$$

From part(c), we know that the second term on the left-hand side vanishes. Also,

$$\frac{\partial n_i}{\partial \ell_j} = \frac{\delta_{ij}}{\ell} - \frac{\ell_i}{\ell^2} \frac{\ell_j}{\ell} = \frac{1}{\ell} (\delta_{ij} - n_i n_j).$$

In particular  $\partial n_j / \partial \ell_j = 2/\ell$ . Using part(a), we then find that

$$\frac{1}{\ell}(\delta_{ij} - n_i n_j)[B_{TT}(\delta_{ij} - n_i n_j) + B_{LL} n_i n_j] = \frac{\partial B_{LL}}{\partial \ell} n_j n_j + \frac{2}{\ell} B_{LL}.$$

On using the facts that

$$\sum_{ij} (\delta_{ij} - n_i n_j) (\delta_{ij} - n_i n_j) = \sum_i (1 - n_i^2 - n_i^2) + \sum_i n_i^2 \sum_j n_j^2 = 3 - 1 - 1 + 1 = 2$$

and

$$\sum_{ij} (\delta_{ij} - n_i n_j) n_i n_j = \sum_i n_i^2 - \sum_i n_i^2 \sum_j n_j^2 = 1 - 1 = 0,$$

we finally obtain Kolmogorov's result  $(-\overline{B}$  in Kolmogorov's notation translates to  $B_{TT} - B_{LL}$ ):

$$\frac{2}{\ell}B_{TT} = \frac{\partial B_{LL}}{\partial \ell} + \frac{2}{\ell}B_{LL} = \frac{1}{\ell^2}\frac{\partial}{\partial \ell}(\ell^2 B_{LL}).$$